Behavioral Insights for the Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)

Applying Behavioral Science to Fight Poverty and Enhance Equity





Ana Maria Munoz Boudet Senior Social Scientist Tokyo, May 24, 2019



### How do we make decisions?



# Think Socially

We cooperate, as long as others do the same, and **rely on** social networks and **norms** 



We do not invent new concepts, but rather use **mental models** drawn from society and a shared history



### What makes decision making difficult?



Adapted from ideas42



else doing?

### What makes decision making difficult?

### Features of the decision

(Incomplete information, unclear goals, conflicting data)

### Dynamic Environment

(Context, people, goals, relationships change with time)

#### Pragmatism (Implementability, morale)

### **Process** Issues

(No clear process, group issues)





### Resource **Constraints and** Politics (Time & money constraints, sensitivities)



### Why behavioral science?



## Standard policy tools

- Information
- Incentives and prices
- Laws



## Behavioral policy tools

- Defaults
- Role models
- Mindsets

## Why behavioral science?

## Policies can benefit from:

- Simplifying procedures
- o Improving choice architecture
- Adjusting information provided
- Sending reminders
- Using social networks and social norms to shape behavior
- Providing and exposing new ideas of mental models and behavior
- Invoking positive identities



- The World Bank's applied
   Behavioral Science Unit, housed
   in the Poverty and Equity Global
   Practice
- A "start up" within a multilateral development bank tasked with bringing behavioral science to development at scale and capacity to our clients



eMBeD

### Timeline

## 2015

World Bank flagship publication World Development Report 2015: Mind, Behavior, and Society

# 2012

Bank teams replicate successful behavioral interventions with positive results





eMBeD, World Bank Behavioral Science Unit





# 2016

- Global Insights Initiatives
- Poverty Behavioral Initiative

eMBeD

### How we work



### eMBeD work and the SDGs



# A few of our projects: Definition and diagnostics

PROJECT EXAMPLES 1, 2, 3, 4

### **Behavioral maps**



















PROJECT EXAMPLES 1, 2, 3, 4

### Encouraging clean energy take-up





### Encouraging clean energy take-up

- To date, big investments in supply side but not in looking at how to improve uptake/behavior
- Big impacts in household health, climate, air quality
- Disproportionate impact on women







#### PROJECT EXAMPLE 1, 2, 3, 4

### Encouraging clean energy take-up









# A few of our projects: Implementation and results

### eMBeD Projects –a quick summary

In Peru, Indonesia, and South Africa. The Peru Growth Mindset intervention led to a 0.14 standard deviation increase in math test scores, equivalent to 4 months of schooling, at a cost of less than \$0.20 per student.





In India, Tanzania, Nigeria, Georgia, well designed and targeted communications campaigns changed behaviors in relation to latrine use, savings, HIV risk behaviors, and son preference. In India latrine used increased by 10%.

In Nigeria, eMBeD found that incentivizing accurate administrative work through social recognition programs and ceremonies increased recordkeeping accuracy by 13%.





in Poland, Kosovo, and Guatemala, trials found that using different language in taxrelated letters increased tax compliance. In Poland – "hard tones" increased tax compliance by 20.8%



### Testing SMS design to increase savings in Tanzania





Control

Simple SMS

Agency

Mental Accounting

**Social Influence** 



### **Increasing HIV testing in Nigeria**







### **Increasing HIV testing in Nigeria**



ago (BEFORE follow up) (AFTER follow up)



http://pubdocs.worldbank.org/en/438421467236362785/Entertainment-Edu-workshop-Flyer-6-3-16.pdf

Tested less than 6 months Went to HIV Testing center Person asked him(her)self for the test

### Control Treatment



### **Increasing HIV testing in Nigeria**



http://pubdocs.worldbank.org/en/438421467236362785/Entertainment-Edu-workshop-Flyer-6-3-16.pdf



Despite 4/5 of individuals know they can get a condom in less than 10 minutes, there are no effects on condom use adoption (surveys or experiment).

> But, there is a reduction on the number of sexual partners.



## At home: water conservation in Cape Town



#### INFORMATION FOR ACTION

### WATER SAVING TIPS

#### OUICK FIXES THINGS YOU CAN DO RIGHT NOW

Take shorter showers

A standard showerhead can use as much as 16 litres per minute. If you shorten your shower by only three minutes, you can save up to 48 litres per shower. For a family of four, this amounts to 5 760 litres (5.76 kilolitres) per month!

Don't leave taps running

A running tap can use 20 litres of water per minute. Turn off the tap when brushing your teeth, shaving and washing dishes. If you spend 2 minutes each day brushing your teeth and you leave the tap running, you use 1 200 litres (1.2 kilolitres) per month. This amounts to 4 800 litres (4.8 kilolitres) for a family of four. Reduce your consumption to only a fraction of this by switching off the tap!



between 40 to 75 litres each bath. A saving of 40 litres per bath for a family of four amounts to 4 800 litres (4.8 kilolitres) of water saved every month!





Please call 021 650 5186 on weekdays between 09:00 and 16:00 with queries.



6 litres of water per minute. Switching from a normal to a water-efficient showerhead can save as much as 10 litres of water per minute. This means a family of four can save 1 200 litres (1.2 kilolitres) per minute each month without any other behavioural change.



Tap aerators, which screw onto your taps, reduce the flow of water by mixing air into the water flow. While normal tap-flow is between 20-30 litres per minute, these water-saving devices can reduce the flowrate to as little as 6 litres per minute.



Older toilets can use as much as 12 litres of water per flush. Converting your existing toilet to a multiflush (interruptible flush) system can halve your water use per flush. If a family of four flushes the toilet 10 times per day, this is a saving of 1 800 litres (1.8 kilolitres) per month.



evaporation by up to 90%, saving the water you would use to top up your pool. If your pool level drops by more than 6cm a week, you might have a leak. Look for cracks inside the pool. Remember that automatic top-up systems are not allowed.



YOU US (Peri



Brick, K., De Martino, S., Visser, M., 2017. Behavioural Nudges for Water Conservation: Experimental Evidence from Cape Town, South Africa. WRC Working Paper. DOI10.13140/RG.2.2.25430.75848

#### FINANCIAL GAIN

# CHECK THIS BREAKDOWN OF YOUR WATER BILL!

YOU USED 34 KILOLITRES OF WATER THIS MONTH (Period 03/04/2015 to 07/05/2015 - 35 Days)

### SOCIAL RECOGNITION

#### BE PUBLICLY RECOGNISED FOR SAVING WATER!

- The City is launching a water savings initiative over the summer months when water usage normally increases.
- Please try to reduce consumption by 10% between November and April.
- As you used 34 kl this month, this means you need to keep your monthly consumption around 31 kl.
- The City will **publicly recognise** the achievement of all water-wise households by **publishing your name and suburb on the City's website.**
- You will be notified of how your household did in May.
- Get saving today!

Not sure how to reduce your consumption? The tips on the back show you how!



### At home: water conservation in Cape Town



### Lower income households responded most to the tariff graph and financial messages

Brick, K., De Martino, S., Visser, M., 2017. Behavioural Nudges for Water Conservation: Experimental Evidence from Cape Town, South Africa. WRC Working Paper. DOI10.13140/RG.2.2.25430.75848



### o ... while high income households responded most to the social recognition



### Improving sanitation in Uttar Pradesh



http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/987801545256336106/pdf/Shifting-Social-Norms-to-Reduce-Open-Defecation-in-Rural-India.pdf



### Improving sanitation in Uttar Pradesh

Changes in both personal behavior and attitude towards latrine use

Statistically significant reduction in reported frequency of open defecation in both sets of treatment villages

0.35	
0.00	
0.3	
0.25	
0.2	
0.15	
0.10	
0.1	
0.05	
0	
0	

http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/987801545256336106/pdf/Shifting-Social-Norms-to-Reduce-Open-Defecation-in-Rural-India.pdf





# A few of our projects: Adapt and replicate

### Improving student performance in Peru, South Africa, Indonesia





### Improving student performance in Peru, South Africa, Indonesia



Fixed: Believing you are born with certain abilities and cannot change them

> Inculcate **Growth Mindset**



Improved learner attitudes towards learning

Growth Mindset is a belief about ones abilities It runs on a continuum, from...



**Growth**: Believing you can grow your abilities through effort and hard work

**Increased effort** and perseverance





### Improving student performance in Peru, South Africa, Indonesia





10% increase in 2017
final Math test
17% increase in 2018
term 1 Math

13% increase in growth mindset index (beliefs about learning)

### Peru: effects comparable to 4 months of catch-up in math.

http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/731961542391505661/Instilling-a-Growth-Mindset-in-South-Africa http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/992261505907400267/Cambiando-la-mentalidad-de-los-estudiantes-evaluaci%C3%B3n-de-impacto-deexpande-tu-mente-sobre-el-rendimiento-acad%C3%A9mico-en-tres-regiones-del-Per%C3%BA



Less than \$1 USD per student to increase test scores by 1 point



## Increasing Tax Compliance (Poland, Guatemala, Kosovo)



http://38r8om2xjhhl25mw24492dir.wpengine.netdna-cdn.com/wp-content/uploads/2016/07/Kettle-et-al.-2016-Guatemala-Tax-World-Bank-Working-Paper-June2016.pdf http://pubdocs.worldbank.org/en/693361497392827604/Tax-report-EN-05-www.pdf



# Beyond the beneficiary: Policy-makers, front-line workers, and experts



### Confirmation bias – the tendency to seek out and interpret evidence consistent with prior views



http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/685691498482210671/Biased-policy-professionals



### Please evaluate this study...

Patients who **DID** use the new skin cream Patient who **DID NOT** use the new skin cream

http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/685691498482210671/Biased-policy-professionals



### Rash got worse Rash got better 223 75 107 21

Please evaluate this study... (different set of respondents)

Patients who **DID** use the new skin cream Patient who **DID NOT** use the new skin cream



Rash got better	Rash got worse
223	75
107	21

### Please evaluate this study...



http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/685691498482210671/Biased-policy-professionals



Income of poorest 40% fell	Income of poorest 40% rose
223	75
107	21



### Data supports good outcome

http://documents.worldbank.org/curated/en/685691498482210671/Biased-policy-professionals

### Correct responses

### Data supports bad outcome

### Cash Transfer Modernization in Bangladesh



### What else and what comes next?

### Using technology for interventions and measurement (VR, games, platforms)





Measuring the tricky things and measuring things well to build quality evidence



eMBeDing behavioral insights with structural reforms (e.g. Social cohesion, unemployment)

#### Who We Are / News

FEATURE STORY | MARCH 21, 201

Helping Women in Kurdistan region of Iraq to Find Jobs





### Identifying ways to tackle sticky norms

# Stay Connected

#### eMBeD@worldbank.org $\bowtie$



E #embed\_wb

bit.ly/eMBeDNews 





